Introduced by Senator Jackson

February 25, 2015

An act to amend Section 437c of the Code of Civil Procedure, relating to civil actions.

LEGISLATIVE COUNSEL'S DIGEST

SB 470, as introduced, Jackson. Civil actions: summary judgment. Existing law authorizes a party, pursuant to a specified procedure, to move for summary judgment in any action or proceeding if it is contended that the action has no merit or that there is no defense to it and to move for summary adjudication as to certain issues in the action or proceeding. Existing law requires the court to grant a motion for summary judgment if all the papers submitted show that there is no triable issue as to any material fact and that the moving party is entitled to a judgment as a matter of law. In determining whether the papers show that there is no triable issue as to any material fact, existing law requires the court to consider all of the evidence set forth in the papers, except evidence to which objections have been made and sustained by the court.

This bill would authorize a court, in its discretion, to rule only on objections made to evidence that is material to the disposition of the motion for summary judgment. The bill would provide that any objection not ruled on for purposes of the motion for summary judgment would be preserved on appeal.

The bill would also make nonsubstantive changes to the provisions. Vote: majority. Appropriation: no. Fiscal committee: no. State-mandated local program: no.

SB 470 — 2 —

1

2

3

4

5

6

8

10

11

12 13

14 15

16

17

18 19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

30

31 32

33

34

35

36

37

The people of the State of California do enact as follows:

SECTION 1. Section 437c of the Code of Civil Procedure is amended to read:

437c. (a) Any-A party may move for summary judgment in any action or proceeding if it is contended that the action has no merit or that there is no defense to the action or proceeding. The motion may be made at any time after 60 days have elapsed since the general appearance in the action or proceeding of each party against whom the motion is directed or at any earlier time after the general appearance that the court, with or without notice and upon good cause shown, may direct. Notice of the motion and supporting papers shall be served on all other parties to the action at least 75 days before the time appointed for hearing. However, if the notice is served by mail, the required 75-day period of notice shall be increased by five days if the place of address is within the State of California, 10 days if the place of address is outside the State of California but within the United States, and 20 days if the place of address is outside the United States, and if the notice is served by facsimile transmission, Express Mail, or another method of delivery providing for overnight delivery, the required 75-day period of notice shall be increased by two court days. The motion shall be heard no later than 30 days before the date of trial, unless the court for good cause orders otherwise. The filing of the motion shall not extend the time within which a party must otherwise file a responsive pleading.

- (b) (1) The motion shall be supported by affidavits, declarations, admissions, answers to interrogatories, depositions, and matters of which judicial notice shall or may be taken. The supporting papers shall include a separate statement setting forth plainly and concisely all material facts which that the moving party contends are undisputed. Each of the material facts stated shall be followed by a reference to the supporting evidence. The failure to comply with this requirement of a separate statement may in the court's discretion constitute a sufficient ground for denial of the motion.
- (2) Any An opposition to the motion shall be served and filed not less than 14 days preceding the noticed or continued date of hearing, unless the court for good cause orders otherwise. The opposition, where appropriate, shall consist of affidavits,

-3— SB 470

declarations, admissions, answers to interrogatories, depositions, and matters of which judicial notice shall or may be taken.

- (3) The opposition papers shall include a separate statement that responds to each of the material facts contended by the moving party to be undisputed, indicating whether the opposing party agrees or disagrees that those facts are undisputed. The statement also shall set forth plainly and concisely any other material facts that the opposing party contends are disputed. Each material fact contended by the opposing party to be disputed shall be followed by a reference to the supporting evidence. Failure to comply with this requirement of a separate statement may constitute a sufficient ground, in the court's discretion, for granting the motion.
- (4) Any A reply to the opposition shall be served and filed by the moving party not less than five days preceding the noticed or continued date of hearing, unless the court for good cause orders otherwise.
- (5) Evidentiary objections not made at the hearing shall be deemed waived.
- (6) Except for subdivision (c) of Section 1005 relating to the method of service of opposition and reply papers, Sections 1005 and 1013, extending the time within which a right may be exercised or an act may be done, do not apply to this section.
- (7) Any An incorporation by reference of a matter in the court's file shall set forth with specificity the exact matter to which reference is being made and shall not incorporate the entire file.
- (c) The motion for summary judgment shall be granted if all the papers submitted show that there is no triable issue as to any material fact and that the moving party is entitled to a judgment as a matter of law. In determining whether the papers show that there is no triable issue as to any material fact the court shall consider all of the evidence set forth in the papers, except that to which objections have been made and sustained by the court, and all inferences reasonably deducible from the evidence, except summary judgment may not be granted by the court based on inferences reasonably deducible from the evidence, evidence if contradicted by other inferences or evidence, which evidence that raise a triable issue as to any material fact.
- (d) The court may, in its discretion, rule only on those objections made to evidence that is material to the disposition of the motion

SB 470 —4—

1 for summary judgment. Objections to evidence that are not ruled 2 on for purposes of the motion shall be preserved on appeal.

(d)

(e) Supporting and opposing affidavits or declarations shall be made by—any a person on personal knowledge, shall set forth admissible evidence, and shall show affirmatively that the affiant is competent to testify to the matters stated in the affidavits or declarations.—Any objections An objection based on the failure to comply with the requirements of this subdivision shall be made at the hearing or if not made at the hearing shall be deemed waived.

(e)

(f) If a party is otherwise entitled to a summary judgment pursuant to this section, summary judgment may not be denied on grounds of credibility or for want of cross-examination of witnesses furnishing affidavits or declarations in support of the summary judgment, except that summary judgment may be denied in the discretion of the court,—where if the only proof of a material fact offered in support of the summary judgment is an affidavit or declaration made by an individual who was the sole witness to that fact; or—where if a material fact is an individual's state of mind, or lack thereof, and that fact is sought to be established solely by the individual's affirmation thereof.

(f)

(g) (1) A party may move for summary adjudication as to one or more causes of action within an action, one or more affirmative defenses, one or more claims for damages, or one or more issues of duty, if that party contends that the cause of action has no merit or that there is no affirmative defense thereto, or that there is no merit to an affirmative defense as to any cause of action, or both, or that there is no merit to a claim for damages, as specified in Section 3294 of the Civil Code, or that one or more defendants either owed or did not owe a duty to the plaintiff or plaintiffs. A motion for summary adjudication shall be granted only if it completely disposes of a cause of action, an affirmative defense, a claim for damages, or an issue of duty.

(2) A motion for summary adjudication may be made by itself or as an alternative to a motion for summary judgment and shall proceed in all procedural respects as a motion for summary judgment. However, a party may not move for summary judgment based on issues asserted in a prior motion for summary adjudication

5 SB 470

and denied by the court, court unless that party establishes, to the satisfaction of the court, newly discovered facts or circumstances or a change of law supporting the issues reasserted in the summary judgment motion.

(g)

(h) Upon the denial of a motion for summary judgment, judgment on the ground that there is a triable issue as to one or more material facts, the court shall, by written or oral order, specify one or more material facts raised by the motion as to which the court has determined there exists a triable controversy. This determination shall specifically refer to the evidence proffered in support of and in opposition to the motion-which that indicates that a triable controversy exists. Upon the grant of a motion for summary judgment, judgment on the ground that there is no triable issue of material fact, the court shall, by written or oral order, specify the reasons for its determination. The order shall specifically refer to the evidence proffered in support of, and of and, if applicable applicable, in opposition to, to the motion which indicates that no triable issue exists. The court shall also state its reasons for any other determination. The court shall record its determination by court reporter or written order.

(h)

(i) If it appears from the affidavits submitted in opposition to a motion for summary judgment or summary adjudication or both that facts essential to justify opposition may exist but cannot, for reasons stated, then be presented, the court shall deny the motion, motion or order a continuance to permit affidavits to be obtained or discovery to be had, or may make any other order as may be just. The application to continue the motion to obtain necessary discovery may also be made by ex parte motion at any time on or before the date the opposition response to the motion is due.

(i)

(*j*) If, after granting a continuance to allow specified additional discovery, the court determines that the party seeking summary judgment has unreasonably failed to allow the discovery to be conducted, the court shall grant a continuance to permit the discovery to go forward or deny the motion for summary judgment or summary adjudication. This section does not affect or limit the ability of—any *a* party to compel discovery under the Civil

SB 470 —6—

1 Discovery Act (Title 4 (commencing with Section 2016.010) of 2 Part 4).

(j)

(k) If the court determines at any time that any of the affidavits are an affidavit was presented in bad faith or solely for purposes the purpose of delay, the court shall order the party presenting who presented the affidavits affidavit to pay the other party the amount of the reasonable expenses which the filing of the affidavits affidavit caused the other party to incur. Sanctions may shall not be imposed pursuant to this subdivision, subdivision except on notice contained in a party's papers, papers or on the court's own noticed motion, and after an opportunity to be heard.

(k)

(1) Except when Unless a separate judgment may properly be awarded in the action, no a final judgment may shall not be entered on a motion for summary judgment prior to before the termination of the action, but the final judgment shall, in addition to any matters determined in the action, award judgment as established by the summary proceeding herein provided for.

 $\frac{(l)}{(l)}$

(m) In actions which arise arising out of an injury to the person or to property, if a motion for summary judgment was granted on the basis that the defendant was without fault, no other defendant during trial, over plaintiff's objection, may attempt to attribute fault to or comment on the absence or involvement of the defendant who was granted the motion.

(m)

(n) (1) A summary judgment entered under this section is an appealable judgment as in other cases. Upon entry of any an order pursuant to this section, except the entry of summary judgment, a party may, within 20 days after service upon him or her of a written notice of entry of the order, petition an appropriate reviewing court for a peremptory writ. If the notice is served by mail, the initial period within which to file the petition shall be increased by five days if the place of address is within the State of California, 10 days if the place of address is outside the State of California but within the United States, and 20 days if the place of address is outside the United States. If the notice is served by facsimile transmission, Express Mail, or another method of delivery providing for overnight delivery, the initial period within which

__7__ SB 470

to file the petition shall be increased by two court days. The superior court may, for good cause, and prior to the expiration of the initial period, extend the time for one additional period not to exceed 10 days.

(2) Before a reviewing court affirms an order granting summary judgment or summary adjudication on a ground not relied upon by the trial court, the reviewing court shall afford the parties an opportunity to present their views on the issue by submitting supplemental briefs. The supplemental briefing may include an argument that additional evidence relating to that ground exists, but that the party has not had an adequate opportunity to present the evidence or to conduct discovery on the issue. The court may reverse or remand based upon the supplemental briefing to allow the parties to present additional evidence or to conduct discovery on the issue. If the court fails to allow supplemental briefing, a rehearing shall be ordered upon timely petition of-any a party.

(n)

- (o) (1) If a motion for summary adjudication is granted, at the trial of the action, the cause or causes of action within the action, affirmative defense or defenses, claim for damages, or issue or issues of duty as to the motion which has been granted shall be deemed to be established and the action shall proceed as to the cause or causes of action, affirmative defense or defenses, claim for damages, or issue or issues of duty remaining.
- (2) In the trial of the action, the fact that a motion for summary adjudication is granted as to one or more causes of action, affirmative defenses, claims for damages, or issues of duty within the action shall not operate to bar any cause of action, affirmative defense, claim for damages, or issue of duty as to which summary adjudication was either not sought or denied.
- (3) In the trial of an action, neither a party, nor a witness, nor the court shall comment *to a jury* upon the grant or denial of a motion for summary adjudication to a jury.

(o)

- (p) A cause of action has no merit if either of the following exists:
- (1) One or more of the elements of the cause of action cannot be separately established, even if that element is separately pleaded.
- (2) A defendant establishes an affirmative defense to that cause of action.

SB 470 —8—

1 (p)

- (q) For purposes of motions for summary judgment and summary adjudication:
- (1) A plaintiff or cross-complainant has met his or her burden of showing that there is no defense to a cause of action if that party has proved each element of the cause of action entitling the party to judgment on that cause of action. Once the plaintiff or cross-complainant has met that burden, the burden shifts to the defendant or cross-defendant to show that a triable issue of one or more material facts exists as to that cause of action or a defense thereto. The defendant or cross-defendant may shall not rely upon the mere allegations or denials of its pleadings to show that a triable issue of material fact exists but, instead, shall set forth the specific facts showing that a triable issue of material fact exists as to that cause of action or a defense thereto.
- (2) A defendant or cross-defendant has met his or her burden of showing that a cause of action has no merit if that party has shown that one or more elements of the cause of action, even if not separately pleaded, cannot be established, or that there is a complete defense to that cause of action. Once the defendant or cross-defendant has met that burden, the burden shifts to the plaintiff or cross-complainant to show that a triable issue of one or more material facts exists as to that cause of action or a defense thereto. The plaintiff or cross-complainant-may shall not rely upon the mere allegations or denials of its pleadings to show that a triable issue of material fact exists but, instead, shall set forth the specific facts showing that a triable issue of material fact exists as to that cause of action or a defense thereto.

(q)

30 (r) This section does not extend the period for trial provided by 31 Section 1170.5.

(r)

(s) Subdivisions (a) and (b) do not apply to actions brought pursuant to Chapter 4 (commencing with Section 1159) of Title 3 of Part 3.

36 (s)

(t) For-the purposes of this section, a change in law does not include a later enacted statute without retroactive application.

9 SB 470

1 (t) This section shall become operative on January 1, 2015.